

**Green-e Governance Board Meeting**  
**Friday, September 4, 2009; 10:00 AM PDT**

---

**Attendees:**

Arthur O'Donnell, *Center for Resource Solutions*  
Bud Beebe, *Sacramento Municipal Utility District*  
Barry Friedman, *National Renewable Energy Laboratory*  
Karl Rabago, *Austin Energy*  
Lars Kvale, *APX, Inc.*  
Rick Weston, *Regulatory Assistance Project*  
Alan Noguee, *Union of Concerned Scientists*  
Mary Carr, *Southern Alliance for Clean Energy*  
Audrey Chang, *Natural Resources Defense Council*  
Cynthia Mitchell, *Energy Economics, Inc.*  
Erin Meezan, *Interface*  
Suzanne Leta Liou, *Renewable Northwest Project (for Diane Zipper)*

*Non-voting members:*

Jay Carlis, *Community Energy*, CMAC Chair  
Pat Keily, *We Energies*, UGPAC Chair

*Called to order 12:05 PM.*

*Chair Karl Rábago welcomed attendees. Roll Call held and quorum determined. Agenda reviewed and adopted. Minutes from May 21, 2009 approved.*

**1. Policy Reminder to Sign Senate EPW Letter, drafted by Chris Busch with REMA and CERT.**

A letter attempting to establish a coalition and target the department of the environment and department of public works was discussed. CRS has been seeking to add geothermal or carbon marketing organizations as signatories. In drafting the letter, the authors discussed output based generally v. off the top. Board members were asked to sign the letter if they had not done so already.

**2. Updates to Green-e Climate Protocol for Renewable Energy Performance and Technology Additionality Test**

Green-e Climate staff was not ready to take this to stakeholder comment at the time. The Board was encouraged to make decisions within the next few months as to whether to move forward.

Currently, Green-e Climate has a timing test, a legal and regulatory test, and a performance and technology test to determine additionality under the Protocol for Renewable Energy. Climate had originally chosen a performance and technology test because of the transparency it provides, but such a test has the drawback of sometimes providing false positives or false negatives. Staff presented data indicating changes in market conditions that affect the performance and technology test. The Protocol calls for the performance and technology test to be updated every

three years or more frequently as necessary to reflect such changes. Staff indicated that the Board should consider agreement on a threshold for ‘beyond business as usual’ under such a test. Other alternatives were also discussed.

Staff and the Board will need to revisit fundamentals of this test and then take a more structured approach to this discussion. The first step identified is to break into a sub-committee and sort out the potential issues and then share the results with the Board.

### **3. Approval of Baseline Emission Rate for Banner Wind Project**

Determining the baseline emission rate for the area in which a renewable electricity facility is located is an important part of the Green-e Climate program. Staff had previously decided that micro-grids will be acceptable on a case by case basis. Staff calculated the combined margin for the Banner Wind facility using an average of the build margin and the operating margin. The build margin was calculated using a weighted average of the emission rates of the generation units in the region built in the last 5 years. For the combined margin, staff assumed that the most efficient unit was being backed down. This calculation is in line with ISO guidance to use a conservative estimate in absence of data. The GHG sub-committee had previously supported approval. The Board approved the baseline emission rate for the Banner Wind Project.

### **4. Update on RGGI**

RGGI verification under Green-e Energy was discussed and options were presented under various scenarios. If there are not enough allowances to meet the set-aside demand, the intuitive approach would be to allow marketers to purchase allowances that are in line with the state’s conversion factor and retire the REC and the allowance together. However, after looking into the RGGI COATS tracking system, staff found that there is no retirement for allowances other than through a state RPS. CRS encourages marketers to work with states to get allowances retired. If voluntary retirement does not occur, it may be possible to have marketers contractually agree to never to resell allowances purchased to substantiate renewable energy sales, so long as lack of resale can be verified.

### **5. 2010 Update to the Green-e Energy National Standard**

Green-e Energy staff discussed a number of potential changes to the National Standard and sought Board feedback on whether to include them in an upcoming National Standard revision comment period. Board suggestions were incorporated. The Board supported that the potential changes be sent to stakeholders for comment except where noted below.

- a. Bird and Bat flyways. While EcoLogo has standards for impacts of wind on birds and bats, Board members pointed out that the standards are very broad and may not be appropriate for Green-e Energy to take on, as Green-e Energy does not certify generators or conduct site assessments. Wind farm issues are typically addressed by other organizations and by state siting laws. Any standards in this area would risk vague definitions and subjective interpretation. The Board decided not to bring this up with stakeholders at this point in time, and suggested that Green-e Energy Staff to continue discussions with AWEA about bird and bat impacts.

- b. Capped pollutants. Staff will remove mercury from the list of capped pollutants in Section III.C of the National Standard, unless stakeholders provide feedback indicating a reason not to.
- c. Voluntary cap-and-trade programs. Staff proposes to treat participation in legally-binding voluntary cap-and-trade programs on a sale-by-sale basis. The proposal is to put general language in the standard about the fact that in certain cases participation in such a cap-and-trade program may affect eligibility, and then treating potential sales individually.
- d. Moving up the new date. Staff proposed ideas for moving up the “new date.” Staff proposal is for a 10-year rolling date that would start in 2011. A benefit of the proposed rule is that the new date would be updated in a predictable way. For facilities that already have long-term contracts Green-e Energy can in most cases approve use of their output through the life of the contracts, to address grandfathering and concerns over changing rules causing ineligibility. There may also be grandfathering of facilities built specifically for green pricing programs as the cost structure for utilities is different from those of a developer. The nuances of grandfathering will need to be considered.
- e. Wave tidal and ocean (kinetic machines). Green-e Energy Staff asked the Board to provide input on wave and tidal generation and possible existing standards that the National Standard could reference. Board members suggested that staff reach out to LIHI, DOE and the Energy Trust of Oregon.
- f. Hydropower. Currently, Green-e Energy does not subject facilities smaller than 5 MW to LIHI certification. Green-e Energy staff sought feedback on whether to remove this limit. At the Board’s request, staff agreed to gather information on the cost of LIHI certification for small facilities.
- g. Methane digesters. The National Standard does not currently reference eligibility of electricity generated by a facility also earning carbon credit for burning biogenic methane. Staff proposed a footnote to clarify that RECs from such facilities are eligible so long as the protocol used to calculate the carbon emissions avoided from methane destruction do not count the REC in the calculation. The Board request that specific language be developed and presented on a future call.
- h. Biomass criteria. Staff asked the Board if there were any areas of the National Standard regarding biomass that the Board would like comments on during the upcoming stakeholder comment period. The Board indicated that there were none.

## **6. Renewable Energy Markets Conference**

Green-e Marketplace staff informed the Board that they are updating the Purchaser’s Claims Brief. They are looking to develop best practices on temporal usage for RECs, and are working with FTC.

## **7. Updates since Last Call**

Dominion Virginia Power has joined Green-e Energy and Carbon Fund has joined Green-e Climate.

*Meeting adjourned 12:00pm.*